

Mr. Fred Krupp, President  
Environmental Defense Fund  
257 Park Avenue South  
New York, NY 10010

Dear Mr. Krupp:

Those of us concerned with charting a rational and sustainable energy policy for the United States were disheartened to see the Environmental Defense Fund (EDF) lend its name and support to an entity called the Center for Sustainable Shale Development (CSSD). The very use of the word *sustainable* in the name is misleading, because there is nothing sustainable about shale oil or shale gas.

These are fossil fuels, and their extraction and consumption will inevitably degrade our environment and contribute to climate change. Hydraulic fracturing, the method used to extract them, will permanently remove huge quantities of water from the hydrological cycle, pollute the air, contaminate drinking water, and release high levels of methane into the atmosphere. It should be eminently clear to everyone that an economy based on fossil fuels is unsustainable.

CSSD bills itself as a collaborative effort between “diverse interests with a common goal,” but our goals as a nation are not, and cannot, be the same as those of Chevron, CONSOL Energy, EQT Corporation, and Shell, all partners in CSSD. These corporations are interested in extracting as much shale gas and oil as possible, and at a low cost. We are interested in minimizing the extraction and consumption of fossil fuels and in facilitating a rapid transition to the real sustainable energy sources—the sun, the wind, and hydropower.

As you know, Jacobson et al. recently published a study showing that New York State could derive all its energy from renewable sources by the year 2030 using existing technologies. Clearly this model, which can be replicated in Pennsylvania and other parts of the country, calls into question the whole notion of expanding shale oil and gas extraction.

That said, we do recognize the need to limit the damage and destruction caused by ongoing extraction operations, but we do not believe that voluntary standards, approved by the industry and “greenwashed” by an environmental organization are the way to go about it. There is a better way to protect the public—it’s called regulation. The oil and gas industry is exempt from scores of state and federal laws and regulations, including

key provisions of the Clean Air Act, Clean Water Act, Safe Drinking Water Act, and Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation, and Liability Act. Any genuine effort to limit the damage caused by oil and gas extraction begins by closing these legal and regulatory loopholes, but as far as we can tell, CSSD does not advocate this important, commonsense measure. Responsible oil and gas corporations should welcome strict regulations and enforcement with damage-proportional fines, because they will apply to the bad actors as well as good corporate citizens.

It is disappointing that the voluntary performance standards set by CSSD often fall far short of what are widely acknowledged to be best management practices. For example, Performance Standard No. 4 calls for open, double-lined pits to store flowback fluid, although closed-loop drilling systems and tank storage do a much better job of minimizing air, soil and water contamination and protecting wildlife—which, not incidentally, also enters the human food chain.

From a public health perspective, there are other glaring faults with the CSSD performance standards. Performance Standard No. 7 permits operators to limit disclosure of the chemicals they inject underground by citing trade secret protection. We simply do not believe commercial interests can be allowed to trump public health concerns regarding underground injection.

The lax nature of these standards is no doubt due in part to the fact that the partners in CSSD apparently failed to consult with the local communities that are impacted by shale extraction operations. It is doubtful that the tens of millions of Americans who live “on the shale” would approve of open waste pits or the underground injection of undisclosed toxic chemicals in the vicinity of their water wells.

While EDF is free to partner with the gas industry in CSSD, we feel it is important that the press and the public clearly understand that neither EDF nor CSSD represents the environmental and public health communities on the subject of shale oil and gas extraction.

Sincerely,

Civil Society Institute

Earthworks  
Jennifer Krill, Executive Director

Friends of the Earth (US)

Greenpeace  
Phil Radford  
Executive Director

Josh Fox

Dominic Frongillo  
Councilmember and Deputy Town Supervisor  
Town of Caroline, New York

A.R. Ingraffea, Ph.D., P.E.  
Dwight C. Baum Professor of Engineering  
Cornell University

Robert W. Howarth, Ph.D.  
David R. Atkinson Professor of Ecology and Environmental Biology  
Founding Editor, Biogeochemistry  
Cornell University

Robert Kennedy, Jr.

Mark Ruffalo

Debra Winger

Advocates for Morris  
Morris, NY  
Maureen Dill

Appalachian Citizens' Law Center  
Whitesburg, KY  
Stephen A. Saunders

Athens County (OH) Fracking Action Network  
Heather Cantino

Bashakill Area Association  
Wurtsboro, NY

Berks Gas Truth  
Kutztown, PA  
Karen Feridun, Founder

Beyond Nuclear  
Takoma Park, MD  
Kevin Kamps

Catskill Citizens for Safe Energy  
Bruce Ferguson  
Fremont Center, NY

Coalition for a Frack-Free Tennessee  
Eric Lewis

Concerned Citizens of Otsego, New York  
Stuart Anderson

Cumberland Center for Justice and Peace  
Leslie Lytle, Executive Director

Citizen's Action Coalition (Indiana)  
Kerwin Olson, Executive Director

Citizens' Environmental Coalition  
Albany, NY  
Barbara Warren

Chesapeake Climate Action Network  
Mike Tidwell, Executive Director

Coal River Mountain Watch  
Vernon Haltom, Executive Director

Christians for the Mountains  
Allen Johnson

Citizens' Greener Evanston  
Evanston, IL

Coalition for a Nuclear Free Great Lakes

Concerned Citizens of Darby (New York)  
Gay Garrison, Co-Chair

Citizens for a Healthy Community  
Paonia, Colorado

Delaware Riverkeeper Network  
Maya K. van Rossum, the Delaware Riverkeeper

Damascus Citizens for Sustainability  
B. Arrindell, Director

The Edge  
Suzanne Moynahan

Fleas  
Slaterville Springs, NY  
Ellen Z. Harrison, Executive Director

Gas Drilling Awareness Coalition of Luzerne County (PA)  
Alfonso Rodriguez, M.D.

Healing Ourselves and Mother Earth  
Jennifer Olaranna Viereck, Executive Director

Interfaith Care Network  
Sally Wingate

Institute for Policy Studies Sustainable Energy and Economy Network  
Janet Redman

Labor Network for Sustainability  
Joe Uehlein

Lehigh Valley Gas Truth  
Julie Edgar, Organizer

Los Alamos Study Group  
Albuquerque, NM

Luzerne County Citizens for Clean Air  
Nancy Dolan

Missourians for Safe Energy  
Mark Haim, Chair

Mountain Justice  
West Virginia

The National Religious Coalition on Creation Care

New York 4 Whales

North Carolina WARN  
Jim Warren, Executive Director

Northern Plains Resource Council  
Walter Archer, Chair

Ohio Valley Environmental Coalition  
Janet Keating, Executive Director

Otsego 2000  
Ellen Pope, Executive Director

Otsego Neighbors  
Julie Huntsman, DVM; Councilwoman, Town of Otsego

Pennsylvania Alliance for Clean Water and Air  
Jenny Lisak, Co-Director

Pepacton Institute LLC  
Jannette M. Barth Ph.D.

Public Citizen's Energy Program  
Allison Fisher

Responsible Drilling Alliance  
Williamsport, PA

Renewable Energy Long Island  
Gordian Raacke, Executive Director

Sanford-Oquaga Area Concerned Citizens (S-OACC)

Sullivan Area Citizens for Responsible Energy Development (SACRED)  
Karen London, Esq., Co-Founder

Sierra Club Long Island Group  
Ann Aurelio

Statewide Organizing for Community eMpowerment (SOCM)  
Knoxville, Tennessee

Shaleshock Alliance  
Lisa Wright

San Juan Citizens Alliance (Durango, CO)  
Dan Randolph

Sustainable Tompkins  
Tom Shelley, Chair

Tour de frack  
Evans City, PA  
Jason Bell

United for Action  
David Braun

Westchester for Change  
Susan Van Dolsen, Co-Organizer

WESPAC Foundation  
Nada Khader, Executive Director

Women's Energy Matters  
Barbara George, President

World Stewardship Institute  
Fred Krueger